

Five critical philological points in the Mahādukkhakkhandha sutta

Venerable Tanamalwila Wipassi¹

Introduction

Majjhima Nikāya is an essential part of Sutta basket. It has included 152 suttās into three divisions. They are Mūlapaṇṇāsaka, Majjhimapāṇṇāsaka and Uparipaṇṇāsaka. There are fifty suttās in Mūlapaṇṇāsaka and thirteenth sutta is Mahādukkhakkhandha sutta. “Greater discourse on the stems of anguish” is meaning of this sutta. Satisfaction, peril and escape are the main point of the Mahādukkhakkhandha sutta. Furthermore, it has mentioned thirteen punishments in period of the lord Buddha. They are Bilaṅgathālikampi – gruel-pot (punishment), Saṅkhamuṇḍikampi – shell-tonsure (punishment), Rāhumukhampi – Rāhu’s mouth (punishment), Jotimālikampi – fire-garland (punishment), Hatthapajjotikampi – flaming hand (punishment), Erakavattikampi – hay-twist (punishment), Cīrakavāsikampi – bark-dress (punishment), Eṇeyyakampi – antelope (punishment), Baḷisamaṃsikampi – flesh-hooking (punishment), Kahāpaṇakampi – disc-slice (punishment), Khārāpatacchikampi – pickling process (punishment), Palighaparivattikampi – circling the pin (punishment), Palālapīṭhakampi – straw mattress (punishment). Theravāda tradition and Mahāyāna tradition are different meaning and interpretation of Mahādukkhakkhandha sutta. Also, when we compare China base text and Sinhalese base text of Mahādukkhakkhandha sutta is more different from each other. It changes in meaning, missing some parallel and paragraph, in grammar and Philological case.

Probable, even Sinhalese manuscripts (Mss) tradition and south east Asian Buddhist tradition are not the same. They are different from each other in philological points. Often Sinhalese mss tradition agrees with European Buddhist tradition and Sinhalese edition (Buddha Jayanti Edition) frequently goes with Burmese edition and Burmese mss.

Research objective

Which words are the best collections between mss traditions. It should be Sinhalese or Burmese traditions and Buddha Jayanti Edition Burmese editions.

¹. Seelawansa Dharmayatana Maha Pirivena. *wipassitherothanamalwila@gmail.com*

Research Methodology

The most essential evidences are given from base text of Sinhalese, Burmese and other editions. Also PTS edition gives good result in this case. Often PTS edition has been following the Sinhalese Mss. Furthermore, mss sources point out variation words so examples are cited from Sinhalese mss. In addition European scholars who are Wilhelm Geiger – A pāli grammar, Von Hinuber – selected papers, E. Mullar- Pāli Grammar, Thomas Oberlies - Indian philology and south Asian studies, K.R Norman – collected papers I to VIII are significant in this case and hope to use the dictionary mentioned below; they are Concise Pali-English dictionary, Critical Pāli dictionary, Gandāri dictionary, PTS dictionary, A Sanskrit-English dictionary, Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit dictionary. In addition, translation of middle length sayings text is followed to understand meaning of Mahādukkhakkhandha sutta.

Research problems

Many philological points can be seen from Mahādukkhakkhandha sutta as examples “nhārusambandham” or “nahārusambandham”, “sigālehi” or “siṅgālehi”, “addhadaṇḍakehipi” or “aḍḍhadaṇḍakehipi”, “pakkaṭṭhiyāpi” or “chakaṇakāyapi”, “ḍaheyya” or “daheyya”. Also these problems were cited by the commentator of Buddhaghosa’s commentaries. By the way, the following are the different readings from various traditions.

(Se.-Sinhalese edition, Be.-Burmese edition, Ee.-European edition, Te.-Thai edition)

- ḍaheyya (Se., Ee., Te.) or daheyya (Be.)
- pakkaṭṭhiyāpi (Se., Ee.) or chakaṇakāyapi (Be., Te.)
- addhadaṇḍakehipi (Se., Ee.) or aḍḍhadaṇḍakehipi (Be., Te.)
- sigālehi (Se.) or siṅgālehi (Be., Ee., Te.)
- nhārusambandham (Be., Te.) or nahārusambandham (Se., Ee.)

The above words belong to all editions. When we compare with their scripts mss and editions, both are not same results. In this case, all problematical problems are solved by philology.

Research Discussion

Daheyya and ḍaheyya are the variation philological words in this case. Both words are probably same meaning but interpretation is difference little bit. Daheyya words goes with only Burmese edition and others three traditions agree with ḍaheyya word. The second word is pakkaṭṭhiyāpi that goes with Sinhalese and European editions, chakaṇakāyapi word prefers with Burmese and Thai edition. Probably, both are possible words but the oldest word should be selected in this case. Addhadaṇḍakehipi and aḍḍhadaṇḍakehipi are essential words. The main case is addha and aḍḍha. Both are same interpretation but philological point should be selected. Sigālehi and siṅgālehi can be seen various parallel in the canonical literature. Sinhalese edition goes with sigālehi and others three traditions go with siṅgālehi. The last word is nhārusambandhaṃ that goes with Burmese and Thai editions. Nahārusambandhaṃ word prefers with Sinhalese and European editions. Always philology agrees with correct version and does not follow traditions.

Research Conclusion

Philological points can be seen mainly Pāli and Sanskrit languages than others. Many Pāli words have come from Vedic Sanskrit that was oldest language than Pāli. Therefore, the main focus should be on Vedic and classical Sanskrit. The following are the linguistically correct words ḍaheyya, pakkaṭṭhiyāpi, aḍḍhadaṇḍakehipi, sigālehi and nhārusambandhaṃ. Sanskrit form of ḍaheyya is dahati but its meaning is beside to heat not burn. The next word is pakkaṭṭhiyāpi or chakaṇakāyapi. Sinhalese edition and Sinhalese mss prefer with pakkaṭṭhiyāpi word and that can be seen many times from canon. Also Sinhalese and European commentaries have gone with pakkaṭṭhiyāpi. According to the philologically aḍḍhadaṇḍakehipi is possible than addhadaṇḍakehipi word. Sigālehi is correct word according to the interpretation of Mahādukkhakkhandha sutta. Nahārusambandhaṃ word can be found from various suttās and Buddhist hybrid Sanskrit dictionary has selected nahāru word but philologically, sn-(Skt) becomes nh-(p.), nhārusambandhaṃ is better than nahārusambandhaṃ. In addition, according to interpretation of Wilhelm Geiger, nharu word can be seen mostly in verses and naharu word can be seen frequently in prose texts.

Keywords: Baskets, Manuscripts, Punishments, Editions

References

Primary sources

- **The Sinhalese script manuscripts.**
- Rev. Buddhadatta, Polwatte (tr.). The **Majjhima Nikāya** vol.II. (2006). Vidyodaya university of Ceylon.

Secondary sources

- Geiger, Wilhelm (2005). **A Pāli grammar.** Batakrishna Ghosh (tr.). K.R Norman (ed.). London: The Pāli text society.
- Oberlies, Tomas (2001). **Indian philology and south Asian studies.** Albrecht wezler and Michael witzel (ed.). Berlin: Walter de Gruyter. New York.
- Rhys Davids T.W. & William Stede (ed.). (1986). **Pāli – English Dictionary.** London: The Pāli text society.
- Horner, I.B. (tr.). (2000). **The collection of the middle length sayings** vol. I. Oxford: The Pāli text society.